



GOVERNMENT MOTIVES FOR PRIVATIZING PUBLIC SCHOOLS IN PUNJAB: EXPLORING TEACHERS' PRECARITY AND EDUCATIONAL EQUITY

Khizer Hayat

Universitas Islam international Indonesia, Depok

khizer.hayat@uiii.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The pros and cons of privatizing education have long been a topic of discussion among policymakers across the globe. The privatization attempts of public schools by the Punjab government are episodic but persist, resulting in a sufficient amount of tension for teachers and countless concerns about educational equity. The study aims to identify the current motives of the government by discovering the driving forces behind privatization and evaluating the job security issues for teachers and academic quality for students of all socioeconomic levels. Semi-structured interviews were conducted in this study, utilizing a qualitative research approach to learn about teacher perspectives from 2 public school teachers and 2 private school teachers from diverse areas within Punjab to know diverse opinions. Respondents belong in Punjab, where public schools have been privatized. Besides, document analysis was used to compare and contrast government policy motives delving further into the issue. The study's findings show that the government's objectives for privatization include cost reduction, increased efficiency, and a desire to attract private investment. However, privatization efforts have resulted in a decrease in employment security for public school teachers and educational equity for students belonging to underprivileged families. Privatization can undoubtedly have cost-effective short-term effects, but it also puts educational equity and teachers' well-being in jeopardy. Thus, the study proposes that policymakers carefully consider long-term solutions that uphold teachers' rights and prioritize education for all.

Keywords: Privatization, Government Motives, Teachers' Precarity, Educational Equity, Public schools

INTRODUCTION

Globally, Governments continue to worry about how to explore supplementary forms of service provision at a time when resources are limited. Calls for quality education are loud, and social needs are changing. Currently, this trend is highly evident in Punjab, where numerous private institutions are rapidly emerging in both urban and rural regions, in addition to the well-established government-run public schools. According to Muzaffar

& Sharma (2011), over the past two decades, Pakistan's educational scene has rapidly evolved and a notable increase in private schools has been observed in recent years, with around 30% of Punjab's school-age children going to private schools.

In Pakistan, especially, Punjab Province has witnessed a culture of privatization of schools, and education management is no exception due to economic, political, and social considerations (Kanwal et al. 2023). This is the reality, due to these varying policy experiences, the precarity within the job of public teachers has never stopped. Likewise, educational equity, one of the fundamental principles of educational policies, is central to these discourses.

Ameen (2024), a current affairs writer, reports widespread protests have erupted in Punjab in response to the government's recent decision to privatize schools. Currently, the country is grappling with the second-highest global count of children who are not receiving education, which exacerbates an already severe situation. The project's first phase includes many schools situated in the districts of Rawalpindi, Jhelum, Chakwal, Multan, Faisalabad, Lahore, Attock, and Gujranwala.

A recent demonstration against privatization by teacher communities and unions took place in several cities of Punjab Province on Thursday, where teachers of public schools expressed their fears and anger. The demands were clear, but the government gave no answer to deal or settle the matter. This is something to keep in mind: Punjab is more influenced because it is a big province in population with a lot of teachers. The renowned DAWN news publication, in the year 2023, as reported by Gabol (2023), stated:

“A large number of educators in Punjab are protesting the caretaker government's stand to privatize 1,000 public schools in Punjab and modify the pension standards. The Punjab Teachers Union (PTU) alleges that the government intends to privatize 10,000 schools, rather than 1,000, and specifically plans to transfer schools with superior infrastructure to the private sector.”

Hussnain (2024) writes, "Kashif Shehzad Chaudhry, President of the Punjab Teachers Union, stated that the Department of School Education has approximately 120,000 unfilled positions." In addition, he stated that government educational institutions would be transferred to the private sector through privatization, without doing a proper assessment of the value of the existing infrastructure, such as buildings and grounds occupied by the schools. The government appears to be presenting a sale promotion similar to a company's attempt to sell the maximum amount of its products. Furthermore, the union wrote a letter to PML-N leader Mian Nawaz Sharif “We ask Nawaz Sharif to play his part in saving these government educational institutions”

The same letter requests that all vacant teaching positions in Punjab be filled as soon as possible.

Significance of the Study

“This study explores methods to propose alternate and moderate approaches for implementation, rather than solely focusing on targeting teachers' rights or to support only Government stance.”

This study attempts to investigate how and why privatization has grown in Punjab's education sector, taking into account economic, political, and social elements. Teachers in public schools are already underpaid and have access to fewer benefits and privileges than other professions. Moreover, if this community is built on the basic need for employment, even if it does not come with high wages, privatization will have a detrimental effect on teachers, much like a grinding machine.

Privatization of government schools has recently sparked a serious debate in Punjab. Therefore, it is important to examine the multifaceted effects of privatization on the education sector in Punjab. Conversely, critics express concern about the issue of justice, fairness, commercialization of education, and marginalized and poor populations affected by privatization offerings. To create and evaluate effective privatization solutions, one must comprehend the different effects of privatization on educational fairness, teacher perspectives, and government aims. Punjab already spends less on education than on department lands like health care, highways, and the department that works under the Ministry of Interior. This means that the main goal of privatization should be to bring back life and stability, not just ignore and reduce basic responsibilities.

RESEARCH QUESTION

The study deeply answers the questions that promptly come to mind and directs one mind to teachers' precarity and educational equality for the following questions to further formulate research design, methodology, and analysis.

1. What are the Punjab Government's Motives to privatize public schools?
2. What are the effects of privatization on teachers' precarity and Education Equity?

RESEACRH OBJECTIVE

To what degrees does the Punjab government intend to privatize the public schools, and what are the effects of privatization on educational equity and teachers' employment security? The objectives are as follows:

- **Explore Government Motives:** Analyse the reasons and the logic behind the action of privatization of public schools taken by the Punjab government.
- **Assess Effects on Education Equity:** Examine how privatization affects equity for education resources and opportunities across the different socio-economic groups and how equalization can be advanced.

- **Examine Teacher Precarity:** Assess the effects of privatization on the teachers' employment and working environment in public education.
- **Provide Policy Insights:** Apply gained knowledge from experience and learnings from theories to promote better policies that will improve educational achievements and equality across the country.

BACKGROUND AND LITERATURE REVIEW

Education plays a crucial role in developing relations and networks, and children are seen as valuable resources for the future. From the beginning, the Pakistani government has made access to education a top priority. Unfortunately, the intended goals could not be achieved due to a variety of issues. Because the local population is the primary recipient of education, it is preferable to involve the local community in its delivery (Khan et al 2018). Historically, in Punjab, public schools served as knowledge camps for children from vulnerable societies. There has been much discussion on how to increase educational quality through flexible regulations, but no long-term progress that is compatible with international educational systems has been noted.

Instead, we hold the belief that privatization reforms can be beneficial when executed proficiently and in suitable educational and economic circumstances. To guarantee successful execution, it is important to have a comprehensive understanding of the components and implications of privatization changes (Levin & Belfield, 1999). Non-governmental organizations are significant contributors to many education systems right now, and their duties are changing significantly. Non-state actors' roles have grown over time, and their contributions are increasingly recognized as going beyond just providing formal education (Steer et, al 2015). From this statement, it is evident that the government can undertake initiatives to improve education. However, in the context of Punjab, these criteria are not met, as highlighted in the book "**Non-state actors in Education in developing countries**".

According to National Education Policy, Pakistan (1998-2010), the government cannot achieve policy objectives on its own and stressed the significance of incorporating the Non-governmental sector in education expansion. The National Education Commission in 1959, the Education Policy in 1979, the Sixth and Seventh Five-Year Plans, and Vision 2025 all emphasized the role of the private sector in improving the quality and quantity of education at all levels as defined in the National Education Policy (1998 to 2010). The National Education Policy (2009) identifies several educational areas that would benefit from the promotion of public-private partnerships (PPPs). About ghost school, here is more discussion:

Punjab's low literacy rate is attributable to poor education funding and government mismanagement. Thousands of "ghost schools" exist solely on paper, with local bureaucrats pocketing their cash. There have been questions from parents regarding

public school teachers' performance. The underperformance of Punjab in the education sector can be mostly attributed to the inadequate amount of public investment (Ahmad Shah Durrani, 2017). The inadequate level of public investment is the primary factor contributing to the underperformance of Punjab's education sector. Before 1984-85, public spending on education was below 2 percent of Gross National Product (GNP). Over the past few years, there has been a rise to 2.2 percent (Memon, 2007).

Teachers Attitudes

Attempts to improve educational equity, according to Levin (2003), cannot be restricted to schools and must take into account policy alternatives for issues that arise outside of the educational system. This is because different populations are often served by private schools. Therefore, trends toward school privatization have the potential to either worsen or lessen educational inequality. According to Busch (1996), his study looks at public school educators' attitudes toward education privatization. Because the Teachers are significant instructors, therefore their perspectives on privatization and problems make them valuable interpreters. Understanding how educators see the new educational landscape and how this influences their practices and attitudes toward privatization is critical to understanding the issue. Beyond politics, procedures, and actions, the government's essential purpose and aims can be identified. The privatization of Punjab's educational policy must be critically reviewed to achieve shared political goals, such as economic growth. Verger, Fontdevila, and Zancajo (2016) used a political economy framework to investigate education privatization communication and implementation around the world.

Privatization Models

Brodowicz (2024) says that when new private schools open and governments back them, it creates competition in the education sector and forces governments to offer high-quality, efficient services to keep customers. This is because parents and guardians will choose private schools over state schools that they think are bad for education. Low-income students in public schools will be the ones most affected because they won't be able to pay for private school spots, but students from wealthy families will be able to avoid the bad education system in public schools. It's important to remember that these private schools are either for-profit or non-profit businesses.

Critiques of Privatization

According to Gupta et al. (2005), outsourcing, a type of privatization, refers to the transfer of services to private organizations. The tradition exists in Punjab government schools, but there is little motivation behind it, and no long-term benefits are anticipated by interested parties. Tilak, J. B. (2008) argues that transforming education from a public good to a tradable service will have significant ramifications. The favorable influence on student performance and parental satisfaction can be noticed, particularly in regions where the number of privately operated schools is increasing (Hussain et al., 2019). From

this study, we can't say for sure what effects privatizing education has had in Punjab. This means that the issue is complex and depends on many factors.

THEORITICAL FRAMEWORK

Neoliberalism Theory

Fundamentally, Neoliberal economic policies implemented in the late twentieth century introduced privatization as a means to apply market principles to public services like education. Proponents of privatization aimed to enhance efficiency, service quality, and enrollment rates, particularly in underdeveloped regions (Hill & Kumar, 2012, p. 45). Neoliberalism emphasizes market-based solutions, efficiency, and privatization. This theory can be used to understand the ideological motivations behind the Punjab government's push for privatization. Analyzing neoliberal policies can help explain the emphasis on cost reduction and attracting private investment at the expense of educational equity and job security for teachers.

“Education systems should be run according to free market principles”

Privatizers are intended to enhance speed, service quality, and enrollment, especially in underdeveloped areas (Hill & Kumar, 2012, p. 45).

1. Giroux and Freire’s Theory of Border Pedagogy

“This theory of border pedagogy advocates a democratic public philosophy that embraces the notion of difference as part of a common struggle to extend the quality of public life.”

Education privatization in Punjab is a tough sociopolitical phenomenon that has attracted different theoretical frames of reference with the critical theory helping dissect some of the realities on the ground. Giroux and Freire are among the scholars who challenge neoliberal political rationalities that promote market-based solutions at the expense of social justice and equity variables (Khalid and Aslam, 2018). These scholars have assumed that most privatization policies deepen social injustices as they promote market forces more than the excluded and vulnerable groups.

RESEACRH METHOD

Interpretive paradigm Research Design

The study employs the interpretive paradigm, which is consistent with the qualitative research technique. This choice stems from the fact that reality is complicated and depends on the environment and surroundings as Creswell and Poth (2017) suggest. Hence, the Interpretive (IB) perspective holds that culture, history, and social processes have a significant effects on human action Schwandt (2000) is suitable for the exploration of the utilization of a special strategy of education in a given area. This research will

utilize a comparative qualitative case study method of data collection. This method provides an understanding of the process of the privatization of policy particularly about the circumstances of Punjab using the case study (Yin, 2018). This particular design is helpful because it makes a detailed examination of the phenomenon possible with further interpretation of various conditions that affect the effects of privatization on teachers' employment instability and educational equity.

Autoethnography

This research also applies autoethnography to add more credibility and substantiate the talk by integrating facts into the discussion and communicating genuine life situations. These are how phenomena are closely observed. Ellis et al (2011) explained another type of writing and research process known as autoethnography as a form of cultural study that focuses on characterizing and systematically studying personal experience.

Case Study

Exploratory research through the use of case studies especially in Punjab province in Pakistan is quite useful when analyzing modern events within an environment with sensitivity to control (Yin, 2018). This is especially pertinent to the research as it seeks to understand the effects of privatization, which is deeply embedded in the circumstances of Punjab public schools. The study deliberately adopts a qualitative methodology.

Semi Structured Interviews

In this qualitative research, Semi-structured interviews were conducted in this study, utilizing a qualitative research approach to learn about teacher perspectives from 2 public school teachers and 2 private school teachers belonging to diverse areas within Punjab to know diverse opinions. Respondents belong in Punjab where public schools have been heavily privatized.

Document analysis

According to Bowen, G. A. (2009), Document analysis is a systematic evaluation of printed and electronic (computer-based and Internet-transmitted) resources. Document analysis, like other qualitative research methods, involves analyzing and interpreting data to gain understanding and empirical information. That's why Document analysis has been used consisting of current news to compare and contrast government policy motives delving further into the issue. This encompasses news updates from both print and social media, with a particular emphasis on the latter due to its comprehensive coverage. However, only information from trustworthy Facebook groups has been employed when reporting on current events, such as the rallies against the government by teachers' unions and communities. The study was conducted in specific locations in Punjab where public schools have been heavily privatized. Thorough comprehension of the case and phenomena is explored by using a sample context in which a teacher in a school will portray all of the conditions of job security and challenges faced by them, as well as the education provided to students. In selecting and compiling peer-reviewed papers, we

aimed to cover every subtle and deep aspect of the issue and to create a balanced formulation of literature that could connect with past research and aid in further discussions on knowledge continuity.

Reflexivity

Reflexivity is incorporated into the research process as a way of self-evaluating the researcher's biases, viewpoints, and stance. Reflexive journaling for recording and explaining the researcher's effects on data collection, analysis, and interpretation to increase the level of reflexivity in the study has been used.

Data Collection Method

Interviews: The main source of data is a semi-structured interview that enables the examiner to ask questions to the participants in an open-ended nature, but at the same time, the interview questions focus on the participant's ideas, incidents or opinions concerning this study, which is privatization in the education sector. Semi-structured interviews mean that the researcher will be asking questions to the key actors about their roles, observations, and perspectives on privatization's effects on education equity, teachers' attitudes, and government motivation. Recording the audio and explaining the procedures and getting their consent to make sure that the information that is gathered is credible.

Data Analysis methods

The data was analyzed by thematic analysis, as defined by Braun and Clarke (2006). This approach entails the process of coding that entails the assessment and categorization of themes in the data. This realistic and versatile method offers a clear account of the results and minor interpretations that are broad and elaborate.

- The Actual online interviews conducted were voice recorded through WhatsApp messages of the participants concerning the research area. All interviews were taped with the consent of participants and then transcribed to the best of the author's ability to elicit responses and the intricacies of language.
- Real studies operated on research papers and the articles retrieved from news sources went through intensive analysis. It is in the context of the above understanding that content analysis was used to analyze and interpret the findings of the selected literature. This mode would allow a synthesis to be made of various perspectives and findings on the topic of privatization as per the context of Punjab schools to develop a sharper and more informed understanding of the particular problem to be addressed.

Ethical Considerations

The current study will approve the American Educational Research Association (AERA, 2011) laid down ethical procedures. Part before data collection all the participants will have to give informed consent which will show that they understand the purpose of the study, the planned use of the data obtained, and the participant's rights to

withdraw from the study at any time they wish. Participants will be assigned pseudonyms to guarantee confidentiality, and the data will be securely preserved.

Findings

The research proposes that authorities modify the strategy of privatization based on the comparisons of other departments' structures. Special attention should be given to transforming the employees' perspectives, particularly about their pay, remunerations, and retirement benefits. While other industries encounter challenges related to salaries and social standing, teachers in public schools also experience difficulties due to their remuneration and societal prestige. This report also advocates for equity in addition to addressing funding challenges, urging policymakers to take action.

Government Motives for Public-Private Partnership

Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) have been crucial in Punjab since the early 1990s. In delivering public infrastructure in the power, telecom, and ports sectors of the economy in an unofficial capacity. The government seems calm and unaffected, actively embracing the privatization process (The United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, n.d.

Case of Punjab Education Foundation

In addition, Malik, A. B. (2010) argues that the PEF has proven the cost-effectiveness of its programs. The government is primarily focused on cost-effectiveness due to the severe economic downturn, which has made it difficult to cover salaries. As a demonstration of cost-effectiveness, the government has introduced the Punjab Education Foundation in the province of Punjab. At times, the government appears highly satisfied with the performance of PEF-PARTNER SCHOOL. However, the truth is that the government is not covering the expenses, as mentioned by a school instructor in an interview. Similarly, Malik, A. B. (2010) states that the Punjab Education Foundation (PEF) has been praised as a low-cost model for providing quality education to impoverished children. The PEF has proved that, through PPPs, quality education at the primary, middle, and secondary levels of private schools can be made available to impoverished students for a far lower cost than in the public school system.

The outcomes of this study shed light on the multi-faceted contexts of privatization processes, educational equality, and teachers' perspectives in Punjab's conventional schools. From the interviews, there are several themes, which are discussed below since this study is qualitative, the major findings are the themes as obtained from the respondents.

Teachers/ Teachers Union Reactions Union reactions

According to Hussain (2024), teachers' associations are against the proposal and instead propose increasing teacher recruitment. The Punjab Education Department intends to implement a private-public partnership model to privatize government schools in the province, including Rawalpindi. The privatization process will commence within a

timeframe of three months, without any set funding allocation. Teacher unions are against the proposal, asking for the recruitment of more teachers. The concerns revolve around the possibility of increased costs, the effects on enrollment, and inadequate support for other educational expenses.

RESULT & DISCUSSION

Effects of Privatization Policies

Because of the recent developments, the literature review of the current study encourages the proposition that the policies of privatization and associated reforms have multiple strategic consequences in the education sector and Pakistani schools. One of them is identified to be the issue of the huge difference in pay and other compensation packages wherein educators in public schools are said to be underpaid compared to those working in corporations. The plight of the teachers in public schools is that they earn less than their colleagues in private schools and they are also not provided with as many privileges as those of private schools meaning that the teaching profession has been socially injustice. This imbalance not only affects teachers' paychecks but the overall progress of society and perpetuates socioeconomic inequality while hindering equity in education. It also focuses on calling upon policymakers to review various policies concerning privatization so that they can prevent the existence of many factors that widen the gap of educational inequality. Moreover, the attitudes regarding privatization strategies like enhancing approaches to teacher recruitment embodied by teachers' unions, appear to seek solutions to these problems within attempting to bring about sustained long-term education reforms.

Protests and implementation challenges

There is a lot of hue and cry over the Federal Government's decision to privatize schools in Punjab which has raised many concerns and criticisms in the sector and the society. The present wave of controversy simply explains the serious implications and difficulty in implementing such big privatization processes in a culturally and geographically large area such as Punjab. This way, the protests enhance awareness of other social problems, for example, access to quality education, issues that are paramount to discussion at the moment. Some crucial barriers associated with the privatization of proposals are: firstly, the practical issues related to the transfer of ownership of school contents by privatized organizations from public authorities; secondly, analyses of the recurrent complaint that privatized-based school systems are not accountable to the public. These issues require attention and discussion to address the needs of the affected people as well as proper adherence to policies.

Operational Dynamics of Public-Private Partnerships

This article examines the flow of operations of PPPs in education mainly focusing on one major concern. It also challenges the channeling of government policies which mostly involve the passing of public property like school structures and facilities to well-named NGOs and private schools. This strategy has elicited quite a controversy in society and among educators in particular about the causes of privatization and the future effects on accessibility and justice in education. In these collaborations, educators state the following: Sometimes it may be difficult to comprehend their purpose and outline possible affiliations and controversies that might affect procedures on decision-making. The focus

of this study is to establish the dimensions of norms and accountability in public-private partnerships (PPP) on education provision and quality. It also emphasizes the synergy of the public and private sectors when it comes to achieving a steady and progressive improvement in education.

Teacher Perspectives and Ethical Concerns

Discussions with educators offer complete and vast knowledge of the ethical dilemmas as well as individual implications of the privatization initiatives. This can be seen when Mr. A, a primary school teacher in Rawalpindi mentioned that the main reason for the privatization of schools is mainly to fill his own pockets with money from authorities. He gives specific examples that show certain people linked to NGOs planning to benefit from the purchase of schools. These disclosures portray the ethical dilemmas and the conflict of interest that are bound to be encountered in privatization projects. This brings questions as to the equity with which educational governance is done. The authors' emotional process during the interviews is the major personal concerns at stake in the privatization debate, suggesting that legislation and philosophical principles are valued by educators and they express their fears about the future of public education in Pakistan. These perspectives point back to ethical discourse and open governance as essential in formulating education policies that will enrich the teachers and the entire educational sphere.

Comparative Educational Effectiveness

Cross-sectional comparisons of public and private school performance are therefore useful in assessing effectiveness and efficiency, and the effects of privatization on learners' achievement. A study done by Alam et al. (2021) revealed that there is a high percentage of results of academic performance as well as facility quality that reflect that private schools perform better than the public ones. Teachers in public schools, for example know these disparities well, because while trying to advocate for change, they acknowledge that it is hard to call for a better distribution of equipment and for, improving the standards of structures behind them, all of which affect education quality as well as the advancement of the students. Day by day educators appreciate the performance of private schools; however, many are in doubt as to how privatization will affect the accessibility and equity of schooling. These results show that the improvement of educational systems and reconstructions are far from being a simple process and that some form of sustainable solutions has to be implemented whereas innovation has to be combined with justice and equity to ensure high-quality learning for every learner.

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS

Regarding several important questions including that of privatization and educational policy, teachers' views influence consensus and policy in the sphere of education. While some educators write that the rank of government collaboration with the private sector is to help enhance learners' achievements, they stress that it is necessary to have fair financing and beneficial policies for educators in various sectors. Despite their institutional affiliations, teachers have the broadly similar perception that to secure the needed numbers and quality of teachers in the long term, salaries must be reasonable and have to be linked with continuing professional development, and job security. Teachers' unions are useful in lobbying for legislation that enhances equal access to

education and changes according to the structure deformities such as inadequate teachers and erratic government policies. The claim of these lobbying operations indicates the necessity of integrated policymaking approaches means educators, policymakers, and healthy stakeholders to formulate adequate educational reforms for all students and all educators.

Last of all, Decrying speaks of the intricate process and the ethics of the school privatization stories in Pakistan. It should also be mentioned that references to justice, transparency, and the advancement of education, in general, can also refer to analyzing the current policies in place to determine if they engender the aforementioned principles. In Pakistan, to establish an inclusive and productive learning system that may cater to the needs of the students, the authorities could take into consideration the opinions and problems of the teachers and other people involved in this sphere.

Conclusion

Privatization of public schools in Punjab has been a very controversial and a big concern for a long time. This paper aims to undertake a synthesis of attempts at the privatization of education in Punjab, the factors that lead to privatization, the voices of teachers, and its effects on the equity of education.

Government Motives and Public Private Partnership (PPP)

The major causes for privatization as prescribed by the government of Punjab are lower costs and to induce private investments. This goal allows the government to build the required infrastructure, improve the quality of education produced, and deal with the problem of funds scarcity through PPPs in connection with the private sector. However, this approach has brought issues concerning the sustainability of the generated equal education as far as equity is concerned.

Teachers' Perspectives and Apprehensions

Teachers in schools are one of the most important components of education systems. Listening to their opinions on privatization helps one to understand the effects of the phenomenon. They include job security, of which many teachers tend to have a lot of fear regarding the same. Privatization means forming contract agreements and as a result, teachers exploitations where they can easily be fired. Besides, they also have concerns that privatization can reduce the quality of education, especially for low achievers.

Equity Issues and Education Quality

Privatization is said to worsen existing conditions in society for it has been reported to compound social ills. There is an indication that poor students may lack the ability to pay for costly fees and get admission into private schools. The study also describes the problems arising with educational policies that should provide equal chances for success based on socio-economic status.

Recommendations for Policymakers

- There is a great need for the authorities to find a good balance between cost control and the quality of education being produced. They should keep into consideration more than present fixes by striving to comprehend long-term fixes. These might include:
- Protecting teachers' employment rights with a particular focus on their employment rights as a result of privatization.

- Some of the recommendations are; policies that enhance the enrolment of needy students in private schools through grants, bursaries, or subsidies.
- Policy formation regulating ways of assessing the status of education in privatized schools.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah Hussain. (2024, March 16). Punjab government plans to privatize public schools. UrduPoint. Retrieved from <https://www.urdupoint.com/en/education/punjab-govt-plans-to-privatize-public-schools-1806001.html>
- Ahmad Shah Durrani. (2017). *Why is there a low standard of education in Pakistan?* Quora. Retrieved July 6, 2024, from <https://www.quora.com/Why-is-there-a-low-standard-of-education-in-Pakistan>
- Alam, F., Iqbal, K., & Iqbal, M. (2021). Comparative analysis of public and private school sectors: A case study of Karachi-Punjab. *Punjab Journal of Educational Research*, 4(2).
- Alase, A. (2017). The interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA): A guide to a good qualitative research approach. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, 5(2), 9-19.
- Ameen, F. B. (2024, January 16). Privatization of government schools in the suffocating educational system of Punjab. *Paradigm Shift*. <https://www.paradigmshift.com.pk/government-schools/>
- American Educational Research Association. (2011). Code of Ethics. *Educational Researcher*, 40(3), 145-156.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative research journal*, 9(2), 27-40.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Brodowicz, M. (2024, March 17). Privatization of education term paper. Retrieved from <https://aithor.com/essay-examples/privatization-of-education-term-paper>
- Busch, M. P. (1996). A descriptive analysis of teacher attitudes towards the privatization of public education (Doctoral dissertation, University of Dayton).
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage Publications.
- Ellis, C., Adams, T. E., & Bochner, A. P. (2011). Autoethnography: an overview. *Historical social research/Historische sozialforschung*, 273-290.
- Gabol, I. (2023, October 15). Handover of 1,000 schools to NGO sparked teachers' protests in Punjab. Dawn. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1781098>

- Gupta, A., Kanthi Herath, S., & Mikouiza, N. C. (2005). Outsourcing in higher education: An empirical examination. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 19(5), 396-412.
- Hill, D., & Kumar, R. (Eds.). (2012). *Global neoliberalism and education and its consequences* (Vol. 3). Routledge.
- Hussain, A., Hussain, I., & Shabbir, S. Enhancing Educational Efficiency in the Public Sector: A Data Envelopment Analysis of Schools in District Sargodha.
- Hussnain, F. (2024, June 5). Teachers union writes letter to Nawaz against privatization of public schools. *Punjab Observer*. <https://pakobserver.net/teachers-union-writes-letter-to-nawaz-against-privatization-of-public-schools/>
- Kanwal, A., Kamran, F., & Rafiq, S. (2023). Perceptions of teachers on government school privatization in Punjab, Punjab. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 39(4), 404-419.
- Khan, N., Khawaja, S. H., & Syeda, S. B. (2018). Effects of public private partnership on development of education in Punjab.
- Levin, B. (2003). *Approaches to equity in policy for lifelong learning*. Education and Training Policy Division, OECD. Paris: OECD.
- Levin, H. M., & Belfield, C. (1999). *Educational privatization*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Malik, A. B. (2010). *Public-private partnerships in education: Lessons learned from the Punjab Education Foundation* (Vol. 309). Asian Development Bank.
- Memon, G. R. (2007). Education in Punjab: The key issues, problems and the new challenges. *Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 3(1), 47-55.
- Muzaffar, I., & Sharma, A. *Public-private debates in education: Whither private*.
- Pervin, N., & Mokhtar, M. (2022). The interpretivist research paradigm: A subjective notion of a social context. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 11(2), 419-428.
- Punjab. Ministry of Education, Islamabad, Ministry of Education, 1998, 1998, 134 p.
- Schwandt, T. A. (2000). Meta-analysis and everyday life: The good, the bad, and the ugly. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 21(2), 213-219.
- Steer, L., Gillard, J., Gustafsson-Wright, E., & Latham, M. (2015, February). Non-state actors in education in developing countries. In *The Annual Research Symposium of the Center for Universal Education*. Washington, DC. Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/research/non-state-actors-in-education-in-developing-countries>
- Tilak, J. B. (2008). Higher education: A public good or a commodity for trade? Commitment to higher education or commitment of higher education to trade. *Prospects*, 38, 449-466.
- United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific. (n.d.). *Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in Punjab*. Retrieved July 3, 2024, from <https://www.unescap.org/>

UNESCAP. (n.d.). *Public private partnerships program of Pakistan*. Retrieved from https://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/pakistan_0.pdf

Verger, A., Fontdevila, C., & Zancajo, A. (2016). *The privatization of education: A political economy of global education reform*. Teachers College Press.

Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications*.